# Case 1:06-cv-0090341171615 The property of AMERICA Page 1 of 20

# JUDICIAL PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION

CHAIRMAN: Judge Wm. Terrell Hodges United States District Court Middle District of Florida MEMBERS: Judge D. Lowell Jensen United States District Court Northern District of California

Judge J. Frederick Motz United States District Court District of Maryland

Judge Robert L. Miller, Jr. United States District Court Northern District of Indiana Judge Kathryn H. Vratil United States District Court District of Kansas

Judge David R. Hansen United States Court of Appeals Eighth Circuit

Judge Anthony J. Scirica United States Court of Appeals Third Circuit DIRECT REPLY TO:

Jeffery N. Lüthi Clerk of the Panel One Columbus Circle, NE Thurgood Marshall Federal Judiciary Building Room G-255, North Lobby Washington, D.C. 20002

Telephone: [202] 502-2800 Fax: [202] 502-2888

http://www.jpml.uscourts.gov

1.00-CV-932

U.S. District Court

500 Poydras Street

Room C-151

Loretta G. Whyte, Clerk

New Orleans, LA 70130

February 8, 2007

U.S. DISTRICT COURT N.D. OF N.Y. FILED

FEB 1 2 2007

LAWRENCE K. BAERMAN, CLERK

Re:

MDL-1657 -- In re Vioxx Marketing, Sales Practices and Products Liability Litigation

(See Attached Schedule A of Order)

Dear Ms. Whyte:

I am enclosing a certified copy and one additional copy of a transfer order filed today by the Panel in the above-captioned matter. The order is directed to you for filing.

The Panel's governing statute, 28 U.S.C. §1407, requires that the transferee clerk "...transmit a certified copy of the Panel's order to transfer to the clerk of the district court from which the action is being transferred."

The Panel has ordered that its Rule 1.6(a), pertaining to transfer of files, be suspended for purposes of this litigation. Accordingly, the transferee district clerk shall request, and the transferor district clerk shall forward, only those files deemed necessary by the transferee district court.

A list of involved counsel is attached.

Very truly,

Jeffery N. Lüthi

Clerk of the Panel

Docket Specialist

Enclosures/Attachment

cc: Transferee Judge: Judge Eldon E. Fallon

Transferor Judges: (See Attached List of Judges)
Transferor Clerks: (See Attached List of Clerks)

JUDICIAL PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION

FEB - 8 2007

FILED CLERK'S OFFICE

### **DOCKET NO. 1657**

# BEFORE THE JUDICIAL PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION

IN RE VIOXX MARKETING, SALES PRACTICES AND PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

BEFORE WM. TERRELL HODGES,\* CHAIRMAN, D. LOWELL JENSEN,\* J. FREDERICK MOTZ,\* ROBERT L. MILLER, JR., KATHRYN H. VRATIL, DAVID R. HANSEN AND ANTHONY J. SCIRICA, JUDGES OF THE PANEL

## TRANSFER ORDER

Presently before the Panel are motions, pursuant to Rule 7.4, R.P.J.P.M.L., 199 F.R.D. 425, 435-36 (2001), by plaintiffs in most actions and the health care provider defendants in the two Oklahoma actions to vacate the Panel's orders conditionally transferring the actions listed on Schedule A to the Eastern District of Louisiana for inclusion in the Section 1407 proceedings occurring there in this docket. Defendant Merck & Co., Inc., favors inclusion of these actions in MDL-1657 proceedings.

On the basis of the papers filed and hearing session held (without oral argument), the Panel finds that these actions involve common questions of fact with actions in this litigation previously transferred to the Eastern District of Louisiana. Transfer of the actions to that district for inclusion in the coordinated or consolidated pretrial proceedings occurring there will serve the convenience of the parties and witnesses and promote the just and efficient conduct of this litigation. Motions to remand to state court can be presented to and decided by the transferee judge. See, e.g., In re Ivy, 901 F.2d 7 (2d Cir. 1990); In re Prudential Insurance Company of America Sales Practices Litigation, 170 F.Supp.2d 1346, 1347-48 (J.P.M.L. 2001). The Panel further finds that transfer of these actions is appropriate for the reasons expressed by the Panel in the original order directing centralization in this docket. In that order, the Panel held that the Eastern District of Louisiana was a proper Section 1407 forum for actions involving claims relating to Vioxx. See In re Vioxx Products Liability Litigation, 360 F.Supp.2d 1352 (J.P.M.L. 2005).

Some plaintiffs and the opposing health care provider defendants argue that the presence of individual and/or local questions of fact as well as differing legal theories should militate against inclusion of these actions in MDL-1657 proceedings. We are unpersuaded by these arguments. Transfer under Section 1407 has the salutary effect of placing all actions in this docket before a single judge who can formulate a pretrial program that: 1) allows discovery with respect to any non-common issues to proceed concurrently with discovery on common issues, *In re Joseph F. Smith Patent Litigation*, 407 F.Supp. 1403, 1404 (J.P.M.L. 1976); and 2) ensures that pretrial proceedings will be conducted in a manner leading to

<sup>\*</sup> Judges Hodges, Jensen and Motz took no part in the decision of this matter.

the just and expeditious resolution of all actions to the overall benefit of the parties. The MDL-1657 transferee court can employ any number of pretrial techniques – such as establishing separate discovery and/or motion tracks – to efficiently manage this litigation. In any event, we leave the extent and manner of coordination or consolidation of these actions to the discretion of the transferee court. *In re Mutual Funds Investment Litigation*, 310 F.Supp.2d 1359 (J.P.M.L. 2004). It may be, on further refinement of the issues and close scrutiny by the transferee judge, that some claims or actions can be remanded to their transferor districts for trial in advance of the other actions in the transferee district. But we are unwilling, on the basis of the record before us, to make such a determination at this time. Should the transferee judge deem remand of any claims or actions appropriate, procedures are available whereby this may be accomplished with a minimum of delay. *See* Rule 7.6, R.P.J.P.M.L., 199 F.R.D. at 436-38. We are confident in the transferee judge's ability to streamline pretrial proceedings in these actions, while concomitantly directing the appropriate resolution of all claims.

Some pro se plaintiffs argue that they will be unable to pursue their claims in MDL-1657. Judge Fallon has, however, emphasized the obligation of the court and counsel to assist pro se plaintiffs in their participation in MDL-1657 proceedings. If discovery sought by a particular plaintiff is deemed to be outside the scope of MDL-1657's common discovery, this plaintiff's discovery can nevertheless be pursued concurrently within the MDL-1657 framework.

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1407, these actions are transferred to the Eastern District of Louisiana and, with the consent of that court, assigned to the Honorable Eldon E. Fallon for inclusion in the coordinated or consolidated pretrial proceedings occurring there in this docket.

FOR THE PANEL:

1000 humas

Robert L. Miller, Jr. Acting Chairman

#### SCHEDULE A

# MDL-1657 -- In re Vioxx Marketing, Sales Practices and Products Liability Litigation

#### Eastern District of California

Gladys Herring, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-1826 Ruth Beatty v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-1845 Mary Grove v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-1941 Donna Moret v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-1954 Maximo Rivera v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-1957 Linda Chamberlain v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-1973 Kap Sook Choi v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-1977 Witold Kolankowski v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-1978 Freeman Herring v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-2079 Emma Miguel v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-2215

#### Northern District of California

Jeffrey Kaufman, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-4921 William C. Mullins v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-5534

#### Southern District of California

Earl Alger v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1888
Douglas Diaz v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1889
Raylene Diaz v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1890
Diane Dumas v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1891
Judy Joseph v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1892
Debra Robles v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1893
Berit Nytzen v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1894
Annette Williams v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1896
Jayn Fields v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1897
Brenda Eldridge v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1898
William Eldridge v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1899
David Fields v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1900
Diane Cross v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1901
Valada Embry v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1903

#### Southern District of California (Continued)

Wanda Alger v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1904 David Young, Sr. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1905 George Dumas v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1906 Carol Demasters v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1907 Helen Eads v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1908 Irma Young v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1909 Evelyn Mazzone v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1951 Jacqueline Battle v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1953 Robert Battle v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1954 James Mazzone v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1955 Norwood Blatchford v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1956 Margaret Choate v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1957 Rosa Blatchford v. Merck & Co., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1958 Horst Baranasch v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1959 Carol J. Heck v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1960 Esperanza Juarez v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1961 Jesus Beato v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1962 Alice Farmer v. Merck & Co, Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1963 Susanne Barabasch v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1964 Nina Pope v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1966 Carmen Ramirez v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1967 Nancy Furman v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1968 Jean Brooker v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1969 Stephen Choate v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1970 Glenna Settle v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1971 Frederick Settle v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1972 Richard Brooker v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1973 Alicia Beato v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1981 Joel Christenson v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1982 Tina Diamond v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1983 Loren Diamond v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1984 Edward Gnau v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1985 Srvilla Harris v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1986 Victoria Kassab v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1987

- A3 -

# MDL-1657 Schedule A (Continued)

### Southern District of California (Continued)

William Kay v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1988 Hank Martinex v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1989 Simena Woo v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1990 Priscilla Wilson v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1991 Bobby Wilson v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1992 Leslie Weldy v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1993 Mary Stromberg v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1994 Leona St. Onge v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1995 Eloisa Santillan v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1996 Betty Michal v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1997 Minh Tam Nguyen v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1998 Lou Ella Holmes v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1999 Betty Jo Kay v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2000 Dearled Knotts v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2001 Joanne Westover v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2003 Stanley Westover v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2004 Sharon Leezy v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2005 Carl Danek v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2006 Lorraine Suder v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2007 Mariane Power v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2008 Louis Roah v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2009 Dorothy Scott v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2010 James Leezy v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2011 Angela Tourajigian v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2012 Arnold Suder v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2013 Jean Roah v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2014 Charles Murphy v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2015 Carlos Baylon v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2016 Debbie Clines v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2017 Juan Leanos v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2018 Michelle Bell v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2019 Robert Brown v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2020 Josephine Baylon v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2021 Kim Hernandez v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2032

#### - A4 -

## MDL-1657 Schedule A (Continued)

### Southern District of California (Continued)

Judith Schuff v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2033 Jeff Goldberg v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2034 Larry Dawes v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2035 Phyllis Cruz v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2036 Jose Cruz v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2037 David J. Hernandez v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2038 Martha Brault v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2039 Inez Goldenberg v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2040 Evelyn Green v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2041 Anita Kincade v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2042 Catherine Janes v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2043 Alfred Brault v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2044 Harold James v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2045 Egon Ohlendorf v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2046 Robert Gans v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2047 Nancy Jackson-Dawes v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2048 Frances Gans v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2049 Denise Radovan-Alfonso v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2115 Francisco Silva v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2116 Maria Santiago v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2117 James Rhodes v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2118 Mark Williams v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2119 Vickie Brendel v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2120 Perseveranda Smith v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2121 Fred Black, Sr. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2122 Jean Cardinal-McQuery v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2123 Bella Jacobs v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2124 Larry Valenti v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2125 Patricia Martinez v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2126 Patricia May Hilliard v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2127 Jan Schmidt v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2128 Steven Hampton v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2129 Jean McNeese v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2130 Dale Lloyd v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2131

#### Southern District of California (Continued)

Augustin Hernandez v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2132 Kenneth Lowry v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2133 Donna Hall v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2134 Jacqueline Lowry v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2135 Dolores Lloyd v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2136 Brian Coit v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2137 Juan Silva v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2138 Frances Bushong v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2139 Maria Osuna v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2152 Thomas Perfetto v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2153 Randy Valentine v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2154 Andres De Casas v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2155 Anna Combite v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2156 S. Anne Hamilton v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2157 Aloysius Kremer v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2158 Winifred Morris v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2159 Darnell Hudson v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2160 Viola Kremer v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2161 Marietta Orpilla v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2163 Joyce Perfetto v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2164 Amineh Younis v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2165 Ahmad Younis v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2166 Michelle McMahon v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2259 Darren McMahon v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-2260

#### Middle District of Florida

Louise M. Griffin, etc. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 8:06-1806

#### District of Hawaii

John R. McClelland, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-543

#### Western District of Kentucky

Cynthia Chesser, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-521

#### Northern District of Mississippi

Michael A. Collier v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-265

#### Eastern District of Missouri

Stephen D. Murch v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:06-1157 Forrest Lincoln, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:06-1372

#### District of Nevada

Albertine Avant, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-1313 Buddy Batiz, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-1317 Don Chapman, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-1319 Norma Coon, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-1320 Ralph Cox, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-1323

#### Northern District of New York

Dennis Richard Harrison v. Merck & Co., Inc., C.A. No. 1:06-932

#### Southern District of New York

Elena Strujan v. Merck & Co., Inc., C.A. No. 1:06-7745

#### Eastern District of North Carolina

Eugene Seals, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-115

#### Northern District of Oklahoma

Wanda Ferrell, etc. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:06-561

#### Western District of Oklahoma

Stella Claypool v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 5:06-1030

#### Eastern District of Texas

Elton White, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-638

#### Northern District of Texas

Rose Fogiel v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:06-1748

#### Southern District of Texas

Dominga R. Castro v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-150 Patricia Hernandez v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-151 Olivia Robinson v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-152 Gwendolyn Ann Herron, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-163 Blanca D. Jimenez v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-165 Veronica Zamora v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-171 Ben Longoria v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-174 Celia M. Sanchez v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-175 Delia Cantu, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-404 Lucia Gonzalez v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-424 Minerva H. Rosas v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 2:06-427 Alison Nettles, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:06-3191 Edward M. Steele v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 5:06-147 Noemi Guzman Mata v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-253 Maria Dolores Herrera, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-255 Estela Guerra, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-261 Cristina Hernandez Mendoza v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-262 Hortencia Rosalez v. Amerisource, Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-269 Maria Gonzalez de Ramirez v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-278 Martha B. Torres v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-279

#### Southern District of Texas (Continued)

Petra Ybarra v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-288
Luis Cantu v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-289
Emma Cuellar v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-295
Maria C. Cardenas v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-296
Gloria Mascorro v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-297
Maria Gloria Ybarra v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-308
Aida Vasquez v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-311
Irma Solis v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-312
Francisca Villarreal v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-315
Elma Martinez v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-316
Elvira Serna v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 7:06-317

#### Western District of Texas

Ronnie D. Fox, etc. v. Merck & Co., Inc., C.A. No. 1:06-748
Barbara J. Baxter v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-749
Katherine Arney, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-771
Eddie Roy Tealer v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-772
Ramona Wright v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-779
Jesus Avila v. Merck & Co., Inc., C.A. No. 1:06-786
Ina M. Teller v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-804
Jonna Murchison v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-805
Brian G. Thompson v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-827
James Townsley v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 1:06-849
Richard Rodriguez, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 5:06-785

PAGE 1 OF 3

# INVOLVED COUNSEL LIST DOCKET NO. 1657 IN VIOXX MARKETING, SALES PRACTICES AND PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

Lindsey E. Albers Barkley Law Firm 401 South Boston Avenue Suite 2700 Tulsa, OK 74103

Douglas A. Allison Law Offices of Douglas A. Allison 500 North Water Street South Tower, Suite 1200 Corpus Christi, TX 78471

Robert F. Arentz Phillips & Associates 3030 North Third Street Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85012

Erik T. Atkisson Reed Smith LLP Two Embarcadero Center Suite 2000 San Francisco, CA 94111

Denise A. Barton Morris, Pickering & Peterson 300 South Fourth Street Suite 900 Las Vegas, NV 89101

Dana A. Blanton Reed Smith LLP Two Embarcadero Center Suite 2000 San Francisco, CA 94111

Carole Bosch Hersh & Hersh 2080 Opera Plz 601 Van Ness Ave San Francisco, CA 94102-6388

Anthony G. Brazil Morris, Polich & Purdy, LLP 1055 West Seventh Street 24th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90017-2503

Donald K. Brown, Jr. O'Bryan, Brown & Toner, PLLC 1500 Starks Building 455 South Fourth Street Louisville, KY 40202-2513 Michael K. Brown Reed Smith LLP 355 South Grand Avenue Suite 2900 Los Angeles, CA 90071-1514

Sarah E. Buchan Best & Sharp 100 W. 5th Street Suite 808 Tulsa, OK 74103-4225

Brandon L. Buchanan McAfee & Taft 211 North Robinson Avenue Two Leadership Square 10th Floor Oklahoma City, OK 73102-7103

Mark P. Chalos Lieff, Cabraser, Heimann & Bernstein One Nashville Place 150 4th Avenue North Suite 1650 Nashville, TN 37219

Kanika D. Corley Morris, Polich & Purdy, LLP 1055 West 7th Street Suite 2400 Los Angeles, CA 90017-2550

Robert W. Cottle Mainor Eglet Cottle, LLP 400 South Fourth Street Suite 600 Las Vegas, NV 89101

Charles A. Deacon Fulbright & Jaworski, L.L.P. 300 Convent Street Suite 2200 San Antonio, TX 78205-3792

Stephanie C. Edgar Copeland, Cook, Taylor & Bush P.O. Box 6020 Ridgeland, MS 39158-6020

Amy Eskin Hersh & Hersh 2080 Opera Plaza 601 Van Ness Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102 Todd R. Falzone Searcy, Denney, Scarola, Barnhart & Shipley 2139 Palm Beach Lakes Boulevard West Palm Beach, FL 33409

Lowell W. Finson Phillips & Associates 3030 North Third Street Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85012

Stephen R. Foster Arnold & Itkin, LLP 5 Houston Center 1401 McKinney Street Suite 2550 Houston, TX 77010

Blanca P. Galo Fulbright & Jaworski, L.L.P. 300 Convent Street Suite 2200 San Antonio, TX 78205-3792

Stephen M. Gracey Frost, Brown & Todd, L.LC. 2200 PNC Center 201 East Fifth Street Cincinnati, OH 45202-4182

Anne E. Grigg Fulbright & Jaworski, L.L.P. 600 Congress Avenue Suite 2400 Austin, TX 78701-2011

Kevin Michael Hara Reed Smith LLP 1999 Harrison Street, Suite 2400 P.O. Box 2084 Oakland, CA 94604-2084

Stuart B. Harmon Page, Kruger & Holland, P.A. P. O. Box 1163 Jackson, MS 39215-1163

Dennis Richard Harrison 6a Short Street Cementon, NY 12414-6913

Vilia B. Hayes Hughes, Hubbard & Reed, LLP One Battery Park Plaza New York, NY 10004

# Case 1:06-cv-00932-LEK-RFT Document 10 Filed 02/12/07 Page 14 of 20 INVOLVED COUNSEL LIST MDL-1657

Jay H. Henderson Cruse Scott Henderson & Allen, LLP 2777 Allen Parkway

7th Floor Houston, TX 77019-2133

Russ M. Herman Herman, Herman, Katz & Cotlar 201 St. Charles Avenue Suite 4310 New Orleans, LA 70170

Robert D. Hoisington Foliart, Huff, Ottaway & Bottom The Bank of Oklahoma Plaza 12th Floor 201 Robert S. Kerr Avenue Oklahoma City, OK 73102

Glen D. Huff Foliart, Huff, Ottaway & Bottom The Bank of Oklahoma Plaza 12th Floor 201 Robert S. Kerr Avenue Oklahoma City, OK 73102

Bryce Johnson Bryce Johnson & Associates 105 N Hudson Avenue Suite 100 Oklahoma City, OK 73102

Alyson B. Jones Butler, Snow, O'Mara, Stevens & Cannada, PLLC P.O. Box 22567 Jackson, MS 39225-2567

Richard L. Josephson Baker Botts, L.L.P. One Shell Plaza, Suite 3000 910 Louisiana Street Houston, TX 77002-9934

Mark Alan Keene Davis & Davis P.O. Box 1588 Austin, TX 78767

Rosalie Euna Kim Reed Smith LLP Two Embarcadero Center Suite 2000 San Francisco, CA 94111

Norman C. Kleinberg Hughes, Hubbard Law Firm One Battery Park Plaza 12th Floor New York, NY 10004-1482 Bruce A. Larson Law Offices of Ian L. Mattoch 586 Kanoelehua Avenue Suite 200 Hilo, HI 96720

Benjamin L. Locklar Beasley, Allen, Crow, Methvin, Portis & Miles, PC P.O. Box 4160 Montgomery, AL 36103-4160

Jeffrey J. Lowe Jeffrey J. Lowe, PC 8235 Forsyth Boulevard Suite 1100 St. Louis, MO 63105

Gerry Lowry Fulbright & Jaworski, L.L.P. 1301 McKinney Street Suite 5100 Houston, TX 77010-3095

Maryanne Lyons Baker Botts, L.L.P. 910 Louisiana One Shell Plaza Houston, TX 77002-4995

Stephen D. Martin Nelson, Mullins, Riley & Scarborough GlenLake One 4140 Parklake Avenue Suite 200 Raleigh, NC 27612

Ramona Martinez Cowles & Thompson, P.C. 901 Main Street Suite 4000 Dallas, TX 75202-3793

Robert R. McCoy Morris, Pickering, Peterson & Trachok 900 Bank of America Plaza 300 South Fourth Street Las Vegas, NV 89101

Andrea L. McDonald-Hicks Reed Smith LLP 1999 Harrison Street Suite 2400 Oakland, CA 94612-2084

Winston E. Miller Frost, Brown & Todd, L.L.C. 400 West Market Street 32nd Floor Louisville, KY 40202-3363 Frank W. Mitchell Maloney, Martin & Mitchell, LLP 3401 Allen Parkway Suite 100 Houston, TX 77019

PAGE 2 OF 3

Jack H. Modesett, III Law Offices of Jack Modesett, III 500 North Water Street Suite 1200 Corpus Christi, TX 78471

Ann B. Oldfather Oldfather & Morris 1330 South Third Street Louisville, KY 40208

Kenneth Patterson Patterson & Wagner 7550 I-10 West Suite 500 San Antonio, TX 78229

Erin M. Pitman Robins, Kaplan, Miller & Ciresi 2049 Century Park East, Suite 3700 Los Angeles, CA 90067-3211

Susan J. Pope Frost, Brown & Todd, L.L.C. 250 West Main Street, Suite 2700 Lexington, KY 40507-1749

Simon Purnell Brin & Brin, P.C. 1202 Third Street Corpus Christi, TX 78404

D. Brian Ratliff
Bubalo & Hiestand, PLC
401 S. Fourth Street, Suite 800
Brown & Williamson Tower
Louisville, KY 40202

Preston E. Roskin Preston E. Roskin, P.C. 222 S. Central Avenue, Suite 1010 Clayton, MO 63105

John H. Shannon John H. Shannon, PA 5300 South Florida Avenue Suite E-1 Lakeland, FL 33813

Jonathan B. Skidmore Fulbright & Jaworski, L.L.P. Texas Commerce Bank Tower 2200 Ross Avenue Suite 2800 Dallas, TX 75201-2784

# IN VOIS WED: 06 UNS 009 27 LEKER FOR DOCUMENT 10 Filed 02/12/07 Page 15 of 20

PAGE 3 OF 3

Mary H. Smith Smith & Smith 4900 Woodway Suite 1030 Houston, TX 77056

Kathryn A. Snapka Snapka, Turman & Waterhouse, LLP 606 North Carancahua, Suite 1511 P.O. Drawer 23017 Corpus Christi, TX 78403

Dori K. Stibolt Squire, Sanders & Dempsey, LLP 1900 Phillips Point West 777 S. Flagler Drive West Palm Beach, FL 33401-6198

Stephen G. Strauss Bryan Cave, LLP One Metropolitan Square 211 N. Broadway Suite 3600 St. Louis, MO 63102-2750

Bryant Matthew Struble Thompson Coburn, LLP One US Bank Plaza Suite 2600 St. Louis, MO 63101

Elena Strujan P.O. Box 20632 New York, NY 10021

Dawn T. Sugihara Goodsill, Anderson, Quinn & Stifel Alii Place, Suite 1800 1099 Alakea Street Honolulu, HI 96813-2639

David A. Tanner Sylvester & Polednak, Ltd. 7371 Prairie Falcon Road, Suite 120 Las Vegas, NV 89128

George Henry Temple, Jr. 613 Willard Place Raleigh, NC 27603

Tyler S. Thompson Dolt, Thompson, Shepherd & Kinney 455 S. 4th Street 310 Starks Building Louisville, KY 40202

Russell G. Thornton Stinnett, Thiebaud & Remington 1445 Ross Avenue 2500 Fountain Place Dallas, TX 75202 Kevin K. Trout
Heron Sweet Fox & Trout, PC
2601 N.W. Expressway
Suite 707W
Oklahoma City, OK 73112

David Reid Wamble P.O. Box 416 Holly Springs, MS 38635

Les Weisbrod Miller, Curtis & Weisbrod, LLP 11551 Forest Central Drive Suite 300 Dallas, TX 75243

Edward L. White Edward L. White, PC 13924-B Quail Pointe Drive Oklahoma City, OK 73134

Phillip A. Wittmann Stone, Pigman, Walther & Wittmann 546 Carondelet Street New Orleans, LA 70130-3588

PAGE 1 OF 2

# INVOLVED JUDGES LIST DOCKET NO. 1657 IN VIOXX MARKETING, SALES PRACTICES AND PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

Hon. Roger T. Benitez U.S. District Judge 4145 Edward J. Schwartz U.S. Courthouse 940 Front Street San Diego, CA 92101

Hon. Richard M. Berman U.S. District Judge 650 Daniel Patrick Moynihan U.S. Courthouse 500 Pearl Street New York, NY 10007-1312

Hon. Rudi M. Brewster Senior U.S. District Judge 4165 Edward J. Schwartz U.S. Courthouse 940 Front Street San Diego, CA 92101-8902

Hon. W. Earl Britt Senior U.S. District Judge U.S. District Court P.O. Box 27504 Raleigh, NC 27611-7504

Hon. Larry Alan Burns U.S. District Judge 1165 Edward J. Schwartz U.S. Courthouse 940 Front Street San Diego, CA 92101

Hon. Garland E. Burrell, Jr. U.S. District Judge 501 I Street Suite 13-200 Sacramento, CA 95814

Hon. Edward M. Chen U.S. Magistrate Judge Phill Burton U.S. Courthouse 450 Golden Gate Avenue Box 36060 San Francisco, CA 94102

Hon. Randy Crane
U.S. District Judge
U.S. District Court
1701 W. Business Highway 83
Suite 928
McAllen, TX 78501

Hon. Frank C. Damrell, Jr. U.S. District Judge 15-200 U.S. Courthouse 501 I Street Sacramento, CA 95814-2322

Hon. Kent J. Dawson U.S. District Judge 6006 Lloyd D. George U.S. Courthouse 333 Las Vegas Blvd., South Las Vegas, NV 89101

Hon. Morrison C. England, Jr. U.S. District Judge United States District Court 15-200 U.S. Courthouse 501 I Street Sacramento, CA 95814

Hon. Irma E. Gonzalez Chief Judge, U.S. District Court Edward J. Schwartz U.S. Courthouse, Suite 4194 940 Front Street San Diego, CA 92101

Hon. Jean C. Hamilton
U.S. District Judge
16N Thomas F. Eagleton
U.S. Courthouse
111 South Tenth St., 16th Floor
St. Louis, MO 63102-1116

Hon. Andrew S. Hanen U.S. District Judge 301 Federal Building 600 East Harrison Street Brownsville, TX 78520

Hon. William Q. Hayes U.S. District Judge 4 Edward J. Schwartz U.S. Courthouse 940 Front Street San Diego, CA 92101

Hon. Hayden W. Head, Jr. Chief Judge, U.S. District Court 1133 North Shoreline Boulevard Suite 308 Corpus Christi, TX 78401 Hon. Thad Heartfield Chief Judge, U.S. District Court 212 Jack Brooks Federal Bldg. & U.S. Courthouse 300 Willow Street Beaumont, TX 77001

Hon. Ricardo H. Hinojosa U.S. District Judge 1701 W. Business Highway 83 Bentsen Tower Suite 1028 McAllen, TX 78502

Hon. David Hittner Senior U.S. District Judge 8509 Bob Casey U.S. Courthouse 515 Rusk Avenue Houston, TX 77002

Hon. John A. Houston U.S. District Judge 1118 Edward J. Schwartz U.S. Courthouse 940 Front Street San Diego, CA 92101-8923

Hon. Marilyn L. Huff U.S. District Judge Edward J. Schwartz U.S. Courthouse Fourth Floor 940 Front Street San Diego, CA 92101-8908

Hon. Robert C. Jones U.S. District Judge U.S. District Court 7005 Lloyd D. George U.S. Courthouse 333 Las Vegas Blvd., South Las Vegas, NV 89101

Hon. Lawrence K. Karlton Senior U.S. District Judge 15-200 U.S. Courthouse 501 I Street Sacramento, CA 95814

Hon. George P. Kazen U.S. District Judge P.O. Box 1060 Laredo, TX 78042-1060 INVOLVED JUDGES LIST MDL-1657

PAGE 2 OF 2

Hon. David F. Levi Chief Judge, U.S. District Court 14-200 United States Courthouse 501 I Street Sacramento, CA 95814-2322

Hon. Sam A. Lindsay U.S. District Judge Earle Cabell Federal Building & U.S. Courthouse 1100 Commerce Street Dallas, TX 75242-1003

Hon. M. James Lorenz U.S. District Judge 5145 Edward J. Schwartz U.S. Courthouse 940 Front Street San Diego, CA 92101

Hon. Jeffrey T. Miller U.S. District Judge 3142 Edward J. Schwartz U.S. Courthouse 940 Front Street San Diego, CA 92101

Hon. Norman A. Mordue Chief Judge, U.S. District Court P.O. Box 7336 Syracuse, NY 13261

Hon. Barry Ted Moskowitz U.S. District Judge Edward J. Schwartz U.S. Courthouse 940 Front Street Suite 5160 San Diego, CA 92101

Hon. Marilyn Hall Patel U.S. District Judge Phillip Burton U.S. Courthouse P.O. Box 36060 San Francisco, CA 94102-3661

Hon. James H. Payne Chief Judge, U.S. District Court U.S. District Court P.O. Box 2459 Muskogee, OK 74402

Hon. W. Allen Pepper, Jr. U.S. District Judge 329 Federal Building 305 Main Street Greenville, MS 38701 Hon. Philip M. Pro U.S. District Judge 7015 Lloyd D. George U.S. Courthouse 333 Las Vegas Boulevard, South Las Vegas, NV 89101-7065

Hon. John S. Rhoades, Sr. Senior U.S. District Judge 3130 Edward J. Schwartz U.S. Cthse. 940 Front Street San Diego, CA 92101

Hon. Xavier Rodriguez U.S. District Judge United States District Court John H. Wood, Jr. U.S. Courthouse 655 East Durango Blvd. San Antonio, TX 78206

Hon. Dana M. Sabraw U.S. District Judge U.S. District Court Edward J. Schwartz U.S. Courthouse Suite 2160 940 Front Street San Diego, CA 92101

Hon. Brian E. Sandoval
U.S. District Judge
805 Bruce R. Thompson
U.S. Courthouse & Federal Building
400 South Virginia Street
Reno, NV 89501-2193

Hon. J. Michael Seabright
U.S. District Judge
United States District Court
C-435 Prince Kuhio Federal Building
300 Ala Moana Boulevard
Honolulu, HI 96850-0001

Hon. William B. Shubb Senior U.S. District Judge 14-200 United States Courthouse 501 I Street Sacramento, CA 95814-2322

Hon. Charles R. Simpson, III Chief Judge, U.S. District Court 247 Gene Snyder U.S. Courthouse 601 West Broadway Louisville, KY 40202

Hon. Rodney W. Sippel U.S. District Judge 10S Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse 111 South Tenth Street St. Louis, MO 63102-1116 Hon. Sam Sparks U.S. District Judge 100 U.S. Courthouse 200 West Eighth Street Austin, TX 78701

Hon. Hilda G. Tagle U.S. District Judge Federal Building & U.S. Courthouse #306 600 East Harrison Street Brownsville, TX 78520

Hon. Lee R. West Senior U.S. District Judge 3001 U.S. Courthouse 200 N.W. 4th Street Oklahoma City, OK 73102

Hon. Thomas J. Whelan U.S. District Judge 3155 Edward J. Schwartz U.S. Courthouse 940 Front Street, Suite 3155 San Diego, CA 92101

Hon. James D. Whittemore U.S. District Judge 13B Sam M. Gibbons U.S. Courthouse 801 North Florida Avenue Tampa, FL 33602

Hon. Lee Yeakel U.S. District Judge U.S. Courthouse 200 W. 8th Street Suite 200 Austin, TX 78701

# Case 1:06-cv-00932-LEK-R**FNV Opverpect 10 kF** | 12/07 Page 19 of 20

# DOCKET NO. 1657 IN VIOXX MARKETING, SALES PRACTICES AND PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

Arlen B. Coyle, Clerk U.S. District Court P.O. Box 704 Aberdeen, MS 39730-0704

David J. Maland, Clerk Jack Brooks Federal Building & U.S. Courthouse 300 Willow Street, Suite 104 Beaumont, TX 77701

Fred Borch, Clerk U.S. District Court P.O. Box 25670 Raleigh, NC 27611

J. Michael McMahon, Clerk Daniel Patrick Moynihan U.S. Courthouse 500 Pearl Street New York, NY 10007-1312

Jack L. Wagner, Clerk 4-200 U.S. Courthouse 501 I Street Sacramento, CA 95814-2322

James G. Woodward, Clerk 3300 Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse 111 South Tenth Street St. Louis, MO 63102-1116

Jeffrey A. Apperson, Clerk 106 Gene Snyder U.S. Courthouse 601 West Broadway Louisville, KY 40202

Karen S. Mitchell, Clerk U.S. District Court 1100 Commerce Street, Room 1452 Dallas, TX 75242

Lance S. Wilson, Clerk Lloyd D. George U.S. Courthouse 333 Las Vegas Boulevard, South Las Vegas, NV 89101

Lawrence K. Baerman, Clerk 345 James T. Foley U.S. Courthouse 445 Broadway Albany, NY 12207

Michael N. Milby, Clerk 101 Federal Building & U.S. Courthouse 600 East Harrison Street Brownsville, TX 78522-7114 Michael N. Milby, Clerk U.S. Courthouse 1133 North Shoreline Blvd. Corpus Christi, TX 78401

Michael N. Milby, Clerk United States District Court P.O. Box 61010 Houston, TX 77208-1010

Michael N. Milby, Clerk P.O. Box 597 Laredo, TX 78040-0597

Michael N. Milby, Clerk P.O. Box 5059 McAllen, TX 78502-5059

Philip B. Lombardi, Clerk 411 Page Belcher Federal Building & U.S. Courthouse 333 W. 4th Street Tulsa, OK 74103-3819

Richard W. Wieking, Clerk Phillip Burton U.S. Courthouse Box 36060 450 Golden Gate Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102-3489

Robert D. Dennis, Clerk 1210 U.S. Courthouse 200 N.W. 4th Street Oklahoma City, OK 73102-3092

Sheryl L. Loesch, Clerk 218 Sam M. Gibbons U.S. Courthouse 801 North Florida Avenue Tampa, FL 33602-3800

Sue Beitia, Clerk C-338 Prince Kuhio Federal Building 300 Ala Monan Boulevard Honolulu, HI 96850

W. Samuel Hamrick, Jr., Clerk 4290 Edward J. Schwartz Federal Building 880 Front Street San Diego, CA 92101-8900

William G. Putnicki, Clerk U.S. Courthouse 200 West 8th Street Austin, TX 78701

William G. Putnicki, Clerk John H. Wood, Jr. U.S. Courthouse 655 East Durango Boulevard San Antonio, TX 78206-1198